Estimating the entry into the pharmacy retail markets

Anton Morozov^{1,2}, Karina Ionkina^{1,2}, Olga Markova^{1,2} ¹MSU, ²RANEPA

Motivation

- Entry barriers assessment is a necessary part of the analysis of the state of competition provided by FAS
- So far in most cases entry analysis was a bottleneck
 - Formal enumeration of barriers' sources
 - No quantitative evidence
- Filling this gap, we conduct entry analysis of the pharmacy market
- Our goals are:
 - To test empirical methodology (Bresnahan, Reiss, 1991) on publicly available data
 - To give recommendations for competition analysis

Why pharmacy market?

- Antitrust authorities pay close attention to this market
- There are many relatively homogeneous enterprises
- A licensed activity data can be obtained from open data sources

Katren&Erkapharm Case (2021)

- 2021: FAS considered a merger between Katren JSC (owns the Melodiya Zdorovya pharmacy chain) and JSC Management Company Erkapharm
 - JSC Erkapharm was recognized as occupying a dominant position (collective dominance) on the retail market for medicines, medical devices and related products within St. Petersburg
 - FAS established a ban on opening new pharmacies
- The presence and surmountability of barriers to entry were not analyzed
 - Preliminary analysis: there are sources of competitive pressure in the retail trade from ecosystems
 - Empirical evidence (European data): legalizing e-commerce makes it easier for smaller firms to enter the market, market concentration decreases (Spektor, Ionkina, 2023)
- The potential restriction of competition in regional markets was not considered by FAS

Data

- Russia, year 2020, municipal level
- Pharmacies data Roszdravnadzor, data.gov:
 - License data, legal entity, address
- Demographics and controls Rosstat, INID:
 - Fertility, mortality
 - Average housing area
 - Number of hospitals, total number of active firms
 - Proportion of paved roads
- Only small markets 20% quantile of population (< 12 139 pers.)
- 405 entries (municipalities, towns)

Number of entities per town (market)



Empirical strategy

- 1. Ordered logit ($N_{dru,gs}$ to all controls)
- 2. Bresnahan-Reiss (1991) model:

$$\pi_N = S(Y,\lambda)V_N(Z,W,\alpha,\beta) - F_N(W,\gamma) + \epsilon$$

$$S(Y, \Lambda) = pop + \lambda_1 birth + \lambda_2 death + \lambda_3 hospitals$$
$$V_N(Z, \alpha, \beta) = \beta_1 pop_{old} + \beta_2 n firms + \beta_3 a partments_size - \sum_{n=1}^{N} \alpha_n$$
$$F_N(W, \gamma) = \gamma_L hardroadrate + \sum_{n=1}^{N} \gamma_n$$

Result: ordered logit

| | | Number of entities | | | |
|--------------------------------|---------------------------|--------------------|----------|----------|--|
| | | (1) | (2) | (3) | |
| Demand | log(birth) | -0.127 | 0.004 | 0.171 | |
| | | (0.339) | (0.331) | (0.286) | |
| | log(death) | 0.884^{*} | | 0.451 | |
| | | (0.465) | | (0.379) | |
| | log(pop_old) | -0.953 | -0.325 | | |
| | | (0.585) | (0.482) | | |
| | log(pop) | 1.765*** | 1.766*** | 1.704*** | |
| | | (0.233) | (0.233) | (0.230) | |
| ked costs | — log(hardroadrate) | -0.264* | -0.275* | -0.283* | |
| Sign:) | | (0.152) | (0.151) | (0.151) | |
| | log(nhospitals) | -0.139 | -0.109 | -0.140 | |
| | | (0.124) | (0.122) | (0.124) | |
| rastructure, | <pre>// log(nfirms)</pre> | -0.331* | -0.297 | -0.301* | |
| competition for – resources | | (0.182) | (0.183) | (0.182) | |
| | log(apartments_size) | 0.308 | 0.530 | 0.033 | |
| | | (0.511) | (0.499) | (0.482) | |

Result: BR91



Result: BR91 – competition



To predict competition

- Example: Bolsheuluysky municipal district of the Krasnoyarsk Territory (OKTMO 04611000)
- How many pharmacies **are** there?
- How many pharmacies **could be** there?

To predict competition

- Example: Bolsheuluysky municipal district of the Krasnoyarsk Territory (OKTMO 04611000)
- There was 3 pharmacies:

| firms_drugs | birth | death | nfirms | apartments_size | nhospitals | hardroadrate | рор | pop_old |
|-------------|-------|-------|----------|-----------------|------------|--------------|-------|----------|
| 3 | 9.7 | 16.3 | 3.610108 | 0.032824 | 2.499306 | 0.87758 | 7.202 | 0.157734 |

- How many pharmacies **could be** there?
- Put original data to likelihood function

To predict competition

| firms_drugs | Likelihood function |
|-------------|---------------------|
| 0 | 1.7060 |
| 1 | 2.0426 |
| 2 | 2.2593 |
| 3 | 1.6860 |
| 4 | 1.5463 |
| 5 | 2.5279 |
| 6 | 2.8788 |
| 7 | 2.9960 |

- ...there was **3** pharmacies
- One more may enter
 - Natural barriers are low the new entrant will reap more profits
 - But are there strategic barriers?

Discussion

- BR91 shows a more realistic result than ordered logit
 - Advanced methods allow you to get a more relevant result
- The method can be implemented on publicly available data
 - Only few data is publicly available
 - FAS has greater abilities to collect data from business
- The model shows the factors that make it easier / harder to enter, but says nothing about whether barriers are surmountable
 - Some insights could be obtained due to prediction
 - Additional analysis of strategic barriers needed